OF ANDREA PAIGHT AND

* AN ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE

MICHELLE LEBAN, * OF THE MARYLAND OFFICE

CLAIMANTS * OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

AGAINST THE MARYLAND HOME *

IMPROVEMENT GUARANTY FUND *

FOR THE ALLEGED ACTS OR

OMISSIONS OF MARK MASTEN, * OAH No.: LABOR-HIC-02-19-37821

T/A MASTEN POOLS, INC., * MHIC No.: 19 (90) 1183

RESPONDENT

PROPOSED DECISION

STATEMENT OF THE CASE
ISSUES
SUMMARY OF THE EVIDENCE
PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT
DISCUSSION
PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW
RECOMMENDED ORDER

STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On June 25, 2019, Michelle Leban and Andrea Paight (Claimants) filed a claim (Claim) with the Maryland Home Improvement Commission (MHIC) Guaranty Fund (Fund), under the jurisdiction of the Department of Labor (Department), for reimbursement of \$23,500.00 in actual losses allegedly suffered as a result of a home improvement contract with Mark Masten, trading as Masten Pools, Inc. (Respondent). Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. §§ 8-401 through 8-411

¹ On July 1, 2019, the Maryland Department of Labor, Licensing, and Regulation became the Department of Labor.

| | | | į | | | |
|----------------------|--------------|--|--------------------------|--|-----------------|---------|
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| Jesev raedu sed | | | 1/48 | | Santa Carlo | |
| | | | | The herief Ex | | |
| | oa see ojeto | | | | | |
| | | | · . | | | |
| | | | \- | ing ayaya daga | OFFICE A | |
| | | | . t. 3-4 2. s. t. | | | • |
| | • | | | i pros encendo si | | |
| | | 8. A. C. | | | | |
| • | | *10 kg (10 kg) | | and <mark>ac</mark> est hode | | |
| | | | · | | | |
| | | | · · | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| • | esto. | 900, 1910 <u>1</u> 940 . 25 61-227 | | | • | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | 0400 30000 00430 00000 | | e. Audži | • | |
| | | | | | | • |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | . Alia a Buri (Parti | | • |
| | | | | ហង្គម៉ូលេម៉ាថា លុខថា គ ន់ ខែកុម ្លា | • | |
| | | | | la present e prili perda e la brasini la presenta se | | • |
| | | | | | | • • • • |
| | | | | er i de la Maria de Santa de Maria de Santa de Esta de la Carla de Santa de S | | |
| ace L Parking of Fed | n ned Sanger | ម្នាស់ មានក្រុម មានក | કેર્મ | .nost-25 pilasti est 4.66 | in the first of | |
| | | | | | • | 4 . |
| | | | | | | |
| | , | | | | | |
| | | | · | | | |

(2015).² On November 15, 2019, the MHIC forwarded the matter to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) for a hearing.

I held a hearing on March 11, 2021 via the Webex videoconferencing platform. Bus. Reg. §§ 8-407(a), 8-312: Code of Maryland Regulations (COMAR) 28.02.01.20B. Edward Norwind, Esquire, represented the Claimants, who were present. The Respondent represented himself.

Andrew Brouwer, Assistant Attorney General, Department, represented the Fund.

The contested case provisions of the Administrative Procedure Act, the Department's hearing regulations, and the Rules of Procedure of the OAH govern procedure in this case. Md. Code Ann., State Gov't §§ 10-201 through 10-226 (2014 & Supp. 2020); COMAR 09.01.03; and COMAR 28.02.01.

ISSUES

- 1. Did the Claimants sustain an actual loss compensable by the Fund as a result of the Respondent's acts or omissions?
 - 2. If so, what is the amount of the compensable loss?

SUMMARY OF THE EVIDENCE

Exhibits

I admitted the following exhibits on the Claimants' behalf:

Clmt. Exs. 1A-1M - Photographs, undated

Clmt. Ex. 2 - Letter from Trevor Sherwood To Ms. Paight and

Melissa Leban, September 6, 2018

Clmt. Ex. 3 - Emails between the Claimants and the Respondent,

various dates

Clmt. Ex. 4 - Masten Pools Estimate, March 22, 2016

² Unless otherwise noted, all references hereinafter to the Business Regulation Article are to the 2015 Replacement Volume of the Maryland Annotated Code.

| in large construction of the | ल क्षे का एकी हा, छहे | haristani (2003) | or 195 Augusta | · ···································· |
|---|--|--|------------------------------|--|
| | | | den san en sa | 014 0) igda 49 |
| gall of Grandadh was | | 1986 tulib bilgsb. | | |
| . Sent of Less Cutters | | i Th) filmat limp to a | | i De jii (e)YO sa Ayy |
| นใช้ ตาลายได้เต็มสาราชนุสร | | er grande dig jorde. Segrande dig jorde | e elle egytetti vili bel | अवद्वर्षात्रुच्या अ ध्या त्रा स्ट |
| | | Viega in britan en | r • Englisher. | er jeosti čej katė. |
| สารสารทรงสุดผู้รูปราชาสุด | | jajejan vo noja | un despoyent links | មានរង្វាស់ |
| d and have the seeding | ြေရ ကျော်နှို့တို့ မိရ | | in the following | द्वारोक्षीत्व व स्वचे त्र ात |
| े कर रेडा महिल्लीहरू करें ने स | | | | e til some skylle |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | oul kan ayan ka | | |
| | | | Yair olimona si so | |
| | | | to the theory of the | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | - 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 |
| | Liz a d | | ្រុក ប្រាស់ទាំងផ្លែង នៅថ្ងៃង | o lade i |
| • | | ध्यात् क्षेत्रीत्र लाक्ष्येतेव्ह्राते । | | |
| िलाहर होती जाने स | St. twines of the ar Nest in metal groups | erici <mark>grif sit.</mark> Karali (p <u>e</u> lene <u>i</u> s | - 1.12 mi | |
| i sa kwagović niji t | ne viere igjal da | | 4000 and | |
| | Diegendel _d ej ensi | | | |
| | | | | |
| ji etak din jila ji didd. Sicat ka zhoa | ngi espiesi G | onder Mente og e r dæ gter Og er | | rederation of extra Left of the orbits of |
| | | • | | |

•

Clmt. Ex. 5 - PoolTech Renovation Quote, May 2, 2019

Clmt. Ex. 6 - Hearing Statement, undated

The Respondent did not offer any exhibits for admission into evidence.

I admitted the following exhibits on the Fund's behalf:

Fund Ex. 1 - Hearing Order, November 12, 2019

Fund Ex. 2 - Notice of Remote Hearing, September 4, 2020; Notice of Remote Hearing, July 7, 2020; Notice of Hearing, February 13, 2020

Fund Ex. 3 - Home Improvement Claim Form, June 25, 2019

Fund Ex. 4 - Licensing History, October 28, 2020

Fund Ex. 5 - Notice of Remote Hearing, December 7, 2020

Testimony

Both Claimants testified and presented the testimony of Trevor Sherwood, Vice President, Pool Operation Management, accepted as an expert in swimming pool construction, renovation, inspection, and remediation.

The Respondent testified in his own behalf.

The Fund did not present any testimony.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT

I find the following facts by a preponderance of the evidence:

- 1. At all times relevant to the subject of this hearing, the Respondent was a licensed home improvement contractor under MHIC license number 4645113.
 - 2. The Claimants own a home in Dorchester County, Maryland.
- 3. Beginning in February 2016, the Claimants began discussing renovations to their pool with the Respondent.

Carlo de Califer Service de la constitución de la c Canal is proceeded given in the contract and is Companies (as the feet of the control of the contro - let give a zona a warming and a let give a let a decident a let साम्ह ता करियम्बर्ध क्यां माहूब कर्न कर्न तो त्या हिना है। A. William Berrich of the Superior in this programmer. 100 in Juli Johann Min Begin From the College COMM Juli House and Applicated from 1999 2018 June 17 Carlo WERE AND COMMENTAL OF SHORT OF STORY The Conduct of the Act of the Act of the iggy identi. on the control of the first of the control of the control of the first control of the control of n om der figt gent fil en er igte given begå halt foar it betal der likerig i te visja blevel ja ben fi That I want take groups god and a compa The state of the s The land of the second second band of sugnition of the encoding national and ends, gain of the education for Associatification and the last of the spin general California and the spin calls of the spin calls of the A Calle 1991, and traver on the Paristal form in the considering and figure and is I to the series in the contract of the contrac rigan – Ligagloviga ir ggjernagli voga i klaskrigi i klaskrigi. Des 1900 bil 1904 av i gvilarig i 🖁 🛒

÷.

i di adis seo yah**ati m**aki i berb

- 4. The Respondent provided the Claimants with several proposals, but none included a proposal to tear down the original plaster in their pool.
- 5. On March 22, 2016, the Claimants and the Respondent entered into a contract to renovate the existing pool at the Claimants' home (the Contract). The Contract provided the Respondent would drain the pool, pressure test the pies, demolish and restore tile, coping and beam, install new white plaster including all leveling preparation needed and a bonding coat installed, refill the pool, remove and replace a section of patio, add a trench pipe to extend the existing slot drain, cover anchors redrilled into the new patio, chemically treat the existing patio, and fill the joints at the brick (Contract).
- 6. The Respondent made an oral representation that he warrantied his work for two years.
 - 7. The original agreed-upon Contract price was \$28,000.00.
- 8. The parties agreed to some change orders to change the type of tile, add additional tile, and upgrade to LED lights. The change orders brought the total Contract price to \$30,285.00.
 - 9. The Respondent began work on the Contract in April 2016.
 - 10. The Claimants paid the Respondent the full \$30,285.00.
- 11. On June 7, 2016, the Respondent emailed the Claimants that he needed to reapply the bond coat he had installed a few days prior. He stated he believed they had a bad batch of product.
- 12. By June 9, 2016, the Respondent informed the Claimants the patio had been poured and the bond coat corrected.

| - कर्मा संस्कृत अन्य के अर्थ क्रिक्स सम्बद्ध <mark>कर्म स्वर्थ के स्वर</mark> ूप | y de melado sár besegues | | |
|--|--|---|--|
| | And the section in the law | . ज रही कर्य विद्या | tos estrogra |
| ्रास्था स्थापना क्रिक्ट विकास है। इस इस देखार है दे | | | |
| er i di jeng tena kang kang di angabasa | | 1 | |
| า การเการมีสูตราพีบุสาก คระบาง (ประชาการที่ยังการที่ เการาชการที่ | | | • |
| dens mail and a man of dense ordered in | | | , |
| ne net impren in make den de hijd i jedine. | | | |
| ารากันและเกรียงเรียก ซากิก รัก และ หลังกระการแกลเลียก | | 1 | • |
| The excellent side of the confidence of | | | |
| | | | in the second se |
| | า สุดไทย ซามม์เทย (กา พ อก ค.ศ.) | naz Joséphorasi. | |
| . Alcalisa a tao atao aga da aga para a | | | |
| | | Mini Na i san | ្រាត់ វិទ្ធស្វាលស្វាល់ |
| | | | - 40 T-308 |
| All file of the second | न्द्री हुई १६ ज़िल्हा, १५५० | er in gyztegitt. | |
| | ्रात्में साम्राप्त प्रकृति अति होत | | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| The part of income to be a strong and the last | | ļ . | |
| there is him it will pay become in it | stud 6 5 voire (2014 oc. 0) of the state of the state of the | ्रकोत्सको हुई स ्त | to se to elong |
| | | 1 and | i sandara I sandara |
| ा १८ विकास कियो हो। हुन्यस्य माण्यस्येष्टरिकारिकारिकारिकार्यः । स्थापन | | ि एक इंड क्यार पृथ्वे इ. १९९७ के इंडिकेट इस् | |
| | | personal de la | |

- 13. By June 16, 2016, the Respondent was working on the punch-list to complete the Contract. At that time, the Claimants brought to the Respondent's attention their concern about expansion joints which were uneven and receding.
 - 14. The Respondent finished work on the Contract by July 1, 2016.
- 15. On August 14, 2016, the Claimants sent the Respondent an email that they were concerned about some cracks developing in the bottom of their pool.
- 16. After inspecting the pool a week later, the Respondent informed the Claimants that these type of cracks were to be expected. He stated that 25% of all new pools that he builds get shrinkage cracks in new plaster and once fixed, they rarely cause issues. He described the cracks as "hairline cracks." The Respondent also told the Claimants that the concrete shell, which he did not replace, was 30 years old and had many hairline cracks in it and that new cracks would continue to form as the shell continued to age, and some of these cracks would emboss through into the new plaster.
- 17. The Respondent informed the Claimants the repair would be done by Wilcoxon, a subcontractor, on August 25, 2016.
- 18. The Claimants asked the Respondent to coordinate the repair to be done at a time when they would be home, as they were concerned because the cracks were growing in number and size.
- 19. On November 1, 2016, the Claimants emailed the Respondent stating they had noticed additional cracks in the pool.
- 20. On June 30, 2017, the Claimants emailed the Respondent that they had opened the pool a couple of weeks prior and the cracking was still of concern.

| alle england griellends my with enigeleng treese stationer in self | , and the contract of the cont |
|--|--|
| the burning of the contract of | a de la companya de |
| en de la companya de | ्रिक्त हो। स्थानिक स्थानिक स्थ |
| | repairs and Opin Al |
| s on pair of lists in a cinaria in insert. | ar jagegeradi - kala 📋 |
| ्रांचित्रेत्री, स्थापनी <mark>के स्थापनी के अस्ति है।</mark> | - ค.ก. ก.วัส การจะไป เมษาสิทธิสุด โดยประจำสุดสุด |
| A short and I reduce the light symbological fed stables from the ex- | i garaget pat (a) |
| . Bilan ongsi skoloj mu svimištas injedespieti in izvimi i | ्यात्राकेक राज्याचे के अन्य क्रम्मेर्ट्स स्थाप |
| ार को केल्क्स कर के कोंगे पर सिन्धां अक्षात्र है जिस्सा करते हैं जिस्सा करते हैं जिस्सा करते हैं जिस्सा करते ह | ergji, wax el sauna en kana ka ka ka |
| . Herby and a work of the desired for the best form of the color was | The Company of state to be a com- |
| anticon con the total property and one of the contract from the contract to th | The second state of the second second second |
| regions to Clarest extra properties for the brigging that how to be to | Andrew Company to subscription of |
| | Autorus Progles principales . |
| The special of the section of the special sec | ការគឺ ខ្លួកម្មាំ មកិ ទ្ធប្រឹក្សា ស្រីការ សង្គ្រា ស្រីការ |
| | Commission of the contraction |
| man en la ramentaj je il hjerosti, rejeterni s jerigile, godjo ji redete | |
| Therefore the call of the class of the form that he brook is been that the co | where the come by the come of the con- |
| | |
| in the state of the second second in the second | ત્યું તે કે લ્લામાં પ્રાથમિક ઉપય |
| | e est a i giorda in padibe assisse |
| eviden agoden sah motoanisan Gadi indicenzion et estali | 1. \$1 95 jun 404. 40 (5. 1.95) (8. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1 |
| 1 | |

1. 11. <u>1</u>

- 21. Delamination occurs when the new plaster surface separates from the surface below it.
- 22. On July 27, 2017, the Respondent emailed the Claimants that he had inspected the pool that day. He said that the pool is about 600 square feet, and there is a small area of 15 square feet where the plaster has delaminated. He could not tell if the new plaster had peeled or if the old plaster below the new plaster had peeled, but either way the repair to be done was the same. The Respondent said he could do the repair in late September or October, when they would be done using the pool for the season.
 - 23. The Respondent insisted that the Claimants pay for the repairs needed.
- 24. On August 22, 2017, the Respondent emailed the Claimants that they had made the choice to resurface over old plaster rather than remove the old plaster, and because of that they were facing these repairs.
- 25. On September 24, 2017, the Claimants emailed the Respondent about the current situation with their pool, which consisted of the following:
 - Major delamination of pool plaster
 - Hollow spots in various places within the pool
 - Cracks in the pool bottom and along the sides of the pool
 - Spot etching in multiple places
 - Water ring lines on the sides
 - Rust marks in the deep and shallow ends of the pool
 - Uneven finish work around vacuum inset and light

| ଅଟ ାୟର ହୁଣ ୨ ୯୯୬ ଫରୁ | निवास्था द ् रिक्ट है। | tana y avocu abbo unitar abo | or nothing being | |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| | | | | . को शबके |
| of the first sport that on meta- | and in the late | iliza a majordiji iliku dele | r vice hade | |
| , i, es ciențiilian c | to a set has post | าก เ กษาชีวิจ การสำคัญ คา | | |
| ge out out to was in w | er også åt Not aver. | daloista liggiaji dak, | | ្ន ស្រុកស្រីស្រីស្រី សង្គារស្តី ស |
| ting the second section is the second | to a government | | r opel antoan | gia bla goit la |
| e je regoj jadović | ान जो असे क्रांटिक | al ul duşan ediyele bir. | o se con control s | 1864 (2.200) (2 |
| | | अवस्थात्र क्रम | Evergen univ i | tok (Krightiger |
| A stable admy | इस्ते १८ स्टब्स् | mini, writing a | ananga pada 1971 | i • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • |
| eliga teriskisti gibosii | ครั้งเป็นเมืองเมโตไก | na kathanga na nga ji M | n 20 aug Alaba | |
| just de karbe rerefuesjar | in the first of the same | ner så fra de vas n | Les ales de la Séries | in tode est. |
| | | | <u>्रम् अध्यक्षक (</u> हर्ने | |
| . and safeafrains | Roži seb biliona | | Magazas . | 3 |
| | 9.4 | การเมื่อสำราช ใน โรยสุดเลย | i de la composition de la composition La composition de la | किस _द ्श से तम्की |
| | | or hoping for | ing Tapang palakan | oljan (19 |
| | | harmal de la como | eratish a alignatik | Jon op |
| | | ន្ទងសំខាន់ (ទី២ ភ្លាក់ទៅ) (១១៣ ឆ្ន | ्रीचर्च । अवस्य स्थापित सं | |
| | | | andam eligi kal | |
| | | | egi k ing dari pakiga | |
| | | odi la Maga epade le bar | | |
| | | | | |

aliteration et british k

- 26. On September 25, 2017, the Respondent emailed the Claimants that water rings, rust marks and etching were all service related. He said they were warned about the possibilities of losing spots of plaster because they elected not to chip out the old plaster first, and if they wanted the spots fixed, they would have to pay for it.
- 27. On August 29, 2018, Mr. Sherwood inspected the Claimants' pool. Mr. Sherwood observed the following deficiencies:
 - There was pitting, cracking, and crazing throughout the entire pool
 - There was unsightly streaking on the walls and step risers
 - The pool surface was rough to the touch, especially below the tile line, around ports, and the rope and floats hook-up
 - There were cracks that were rough as calcium has effervesced on the pool walls
 - There were areas on the pool walls emitting "champagne bubbles" when touched as there was air trapped between the original pool surface and the failing replastered surface
 - There were a few chipped areas in the pool
 - The vacuum port adapter and light were uneven and not sitting flush with the wall
 - The pool floor was mostly hollow and there were multiple cracks on the pool floor, greater than one foot in length and most areas where you step the floor cracked below your feet
 - The area of delamination on the floor measured approximately five feet long by three and one-half feet wide and extended toward the deep end up to one foot and up to eight feet toward the shallow end and three feet on each width below the failing re-plastered surface

| Camping of participal between the fisher | e object district | |
|--|---|--|
| สภาพัย รักษา เพราะเกรา | (Hose Class, 1989) | |
| n 18 han order day know the | | |
| | | larve gap Larve percent in the co- |
| tary substant and employed arrive. | | |
| | | Constitution of the state of the |
| कार्य के स्टब्स्टर के स्टब्स्टर है | ingra om i <mark>de</mark> gjaldele. Degra | |
| mining and the | i Barras <mark>an P</mark> alaman | |
| | egaskers og fliggar. e | |
| | | ्राष्ट्रकार विकास है। अपेत |
| provinces of the same of the age | | |
| Congress of a referred construction (| | er er programmen en en er |
| many properties and to | rjaka jest recejser | |
| | | केंद्रभाग के प्रियम है। |
| | | . said i also rediti e |
| and the state of t | s was perfect that | resissaria de la compansión de la compan |
| er og £2. må toder i stophilip et æ d | alities in the state of the state of | |
| कर ^{करा} , इसके प्राप्त कराईन कराव किया | Kiring strategy and the | Complete the Complete |
| | ea. | na jeda aktoria |
| The way said of the best of the leading the second | ina maratraj | restable registification |
| | gulegor je ji seli sekrol i di : | to a find the final are still to |
| | andayyi di kiris | na minimaty |
| | esa (territoria) | in andere glader |
| | | ************************************** |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

- Portions of the delaminated surface were present showing measurements of less than 3/8" up to greater than 3/4"
- There were trowel markings on the deep end floor and walls
- The expansion joint was cracked
- There were cracks between the coping and the top of the tile in multiple areas
- Multiple coping stones were hollow at the handrail, both sides of the deep end skimmer, and most of the length opposite the steps.
- 28. The purpose of the expansion joint is to isolate concrete deck movement from the pool coping and bond beam. A cracked expansion joint and cracks between the tile and coping can cause problems by allowing water to penetrate in those joints and get beneath and behind the coping, tiling, and/or pool shell. When that water freezes it expands, and when it thaws it will contract. This repeated freezing and thawing causes tile and coping to become hollow, crack, and fall off.
- 29. The poor condition of the Claimants' pool was caused by the improper plastering performed by the Respondent. The resurfacing done in 2016 did not meet the thickness parameters that are industry standard. The original pool shell was not properly prepared to ensure a firm bonding between it and the re-plaster. Since the surface was not properly prepared the replastered surface did not bond to the pool. The calcium effervescence, trowel marks, and rough surfaces are a result of improper application.
- 30. The damage is too severe to remove and patch the delaminated areas. The existing pool surface needs to be removed, the substrate properly prepped, and then the pool properly replastered. The expansion joint needs to be repaired in multiple areas.
 - 31. The Claimants' pool can be repaired for \$23,500.00.

| t and he armine to the color of model teaching seasy position in read to the self-to and the color of |
|--|
| |
| e de de de la companya della company |
| Modern Court of the Court of th |
| e i generali, i i granda e di la giul sui sue per per per primere di la companya de la companya de la companya |
| The more partitions in their in increases they will be one of the contract of |
| The section of the provide pulled of the section of |
| The state of the s |
| parties and the control of the second of the first of the second of the |
| and the state of t |
| The transfer of the first of the second transfer of the first of the second transfer of the |
| of the specific superior and the printer into printer in any or when the more result in any position in the so- |
| |
| and the converged for publications of the contained for the property of the contained for the containe |
| The second of the second secon |
| Comment of the commen |
| ्रामितित्र आकार तो प्रमुख्य हिमानाम अति । चान बद्धादि अवस्थित ए । चात्र मा का प्राप्त निर्वाह से का स्थापना विक |
| There were related the construction of the confidence of the confi |
| าง () และ เมื่อสุด และ เมื่อสุด เมื่อสุด และ เมื่อสุด และ เมื่อส |
| Beilder Britan in the second control of the first of the first of the first of the second of the sec |
| - A The company of the second |
| The state of the production participated and the state of |
| 1.00.00 (1.05) Emphision on the American Property of the American States |
| |
| |
| |
| |

DISCUSSION

In this case, the Claimants have the burden of proving the validity of the Claim by a preponderance of the evidence. Bus. Reg. § 8-407(e)(1); Md. Code Ann., State Gov't § 10-217 (2014); COMAR 09.08.03.03A(3). To prove a claim by a preponderance of the evidence means to show that it is "more likely so than not so" when all the evidence is considered. Coleman v. Anne Arundel Cty. Police Dep't, 369 Md. 108, 125 n.16 (2002).

An owner may recover compensation from the Fund "for an actual loss that results from an act or omission by a licensed contractor" Bus. Reg. § 8-405(a); see also COMAR 09.08.03.03B(2) ("The Fund may only compensate claimants for actual losses . . . incurred as a result of misconduct by a licensed contractor."). "[A]ctual loss' means the costs of restoration, repair, replacement, or completion that arise from an unworkmanlike, inadequate, or incomplete home improvement." Bus. Reg. § 8-401.

The Respondent was a licensed home improvement contractor at the time he entered into the Contract with the Claimants. Certain claimants are excluded from recovering from the Fund altogether. In this regard, a claimant must prove that: (a) the claimant resides in the home as to which the claim is made, or owns no more than three dwelling places; (b) the claimant is not an employee, officer or partner of the contractor; or the spouse or other immediate relative of the contractor or the contractor's employees, officers or partners; (c) the work at issue did not involve new home construction; (d) the claimant did not unreasonably reject the contractor's good faith effort to resolve the claim; (e) the claimant complied with any contractual arbitration clause before seeking compensation from the Fund; (f) there is no pending claim for the same loss in any court of competent jurisdiction and the claimant did not recover for the actual loss from any source; and (g) the claimant filed the claim with the MHIC within three years of the

The state of the s

an em ner admign eine inergena in entgene in "Te seu in 1888 for seund besitz in in indigen in de general in de ge

The consequence of a segment of the consequence of

date the claimant knew, or with reasonable diligence should have known, of the loss or damage. Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. §§ 8-405(c), (d), (f), and (g), 8-408(b)(1); Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-101(g)(3)(i) (Supp. 2019). The undisputed evidence in this case establishes there are no prima facie impediments barring the Claimants from recovering from the Fund. Id. For the following reasons, I find that the Claimants have proven eligibility for compensation.

The photographs provided by the Claimants show a pool in shockingly poor condition, within only two years of the pool renovation. The delamination is severe, obvious to a layperson, and gives the appearance of an abandoned pool. It is not only unsightly, but extremely dangerous, given the possibility of someone getting a limb or article of clothing caught in the gaps. Moreover, the cracking and delamination began to occur within only months of the completion of the project.

The Respondent argued vehemently that he informed the Claimants that he recommended ripping out the plaster due to the age of their pool and the concrete. While he claims that he provided them with this proposal, which was \$8,000.00 or \$10,000.00 more than the price the Claimants paid, the Respondent was unable to produce that proposal. The Respondent, who all parties agreed drafted the written contract, contends that he had a verbal agreement with the Claimants that he was providing a one year warranty on the replumbing, tile, coping, and poured concrete decking, but specifically informed the Claimants he would not and could not warranty the plaster.

The Respondent's testimony is simply unbelievable. He contends that he specifically recommended the Claimants rip out the former plaster and warned them of the problems they might experience if they did not do so, but has nothing in writing to support that. Moreover, he claims a very detailed recollection that he provided a warranty as to four items, but not as to a

agus en carrent millogue es de del filogue nombro diesgrad a ditionar de espera, al colonida agrandam a por el aport por el 1900 (1900 de 1900) que agranda de 1900 (1900) en el 1900 de 1900 de 1900 de 19 re, the transcript House are all out to convert which the first of the interference of the 1822 of ur ach Nobald of rabb sarrous a so desemble i sport of keep to det cast bar legiografia de la comparticipa de la comparte de la comparticipa de la and the property of the state o wantan merikan kanan dan kasal di perbagaian dan kebangan penganjan A HE CENTED THE PROPERTY OF CHECKING THE BEST AND A PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY O

rative and a compartant state and comparting and entering of what only in size in which are a first tradition तुन विकास कर के हैं के प्राप्त के का कर है का का किस करने अपने के किस कर है के हैं कि का है कर के का की किस के Carried to a contention of the Contention of the Indian of the American sign and the transfer of the contention tion de modernoment util subgrouphant controler i different de l'éparticult de la propiet de la communication ใหญ่ ที่และใหญ่และ หมูน ใช้ทำหนอง ในเลก ไม่สับให้เขาและ เมืองเหลว่า ๆ ก็ของ เล่น แล้งและกระโรก และโดยส attakanan et etin valagila jinit jurat juga zinam affah dahikanan telah teranin til en en en de litera la comingense de la comingense de la comineración de la comingense de la companya de la comi

r timo francia vantaria di samo ri sigi i i dia mendiriti affilia di ri falla di militari minalia. Ana 12 i Et on agreement that the later of the first form of profession and the first of the fi rear out to A dight of the analysis of gradient of antistrony and held or and the filter of the distribution of their

and the adjection of the employed the first of the grant dealing the contract of the grant of the contract the contract of the CONTRACTOR OF THE SERVICE

si sw

at en su a sa i jarge i la jarge set in sa ka sa indicina da mati e principe se ja ilizir è escar sa primi ric

fifth, but again, there exists nothing in writing to support that claim. In any event, this is not a warranty issue – it is an issue of adequate and workmanlike home improvement. There is nothing in the Business Regulation Article of the Maryland Code that would allow the Respondent to specifically preclude a homeowner's right to receive adequate, complete, and workmanlike home improvement.

The Claimants' expert, who was thorough and eminently credible, testified that the problem with the Claimants' pool was not the existing plaster or concrete, as the Respondent argued, but the application of the new plaster coat. It was done poorly and not to industry specifications. The Respondent's argument that the Claimants' expert did not conduct his inspection until two years after the pool renovation is unavailing, as the cracks and delamination began to appear within months of the completion of the project. An adequate and workmanlike home improvement should last more than months after a \$30,000.00 pool renovation and in the case of a project this large, should have lasted years.

The Respondent performed unworkmanlike, inadequate, or incomplete home improvements. I thus find that the Claimants are eligible for compensation from the Fund.

Having found eligibility for compensation I must determine the amount of the Claimants' actual loss and the amount, if any, that the Claimants are entitled to recover. The Fund may not compensate a claimant for consequential or punitive damages, personal injury, attorney fees, court costs, or interest. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(3); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(1). The MHIC's regulations provide three formulas to measure a claimant's actual loss, depending on the status of the contract work.

In this case, the Respondent performed some work under the Contract, and the Claimants intend to retain other contractors to complete or remedy that work. The Claimants' expert was

AT A DESCRIPTION OF THE STREET (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(3) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(4) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(5) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(6) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(7) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2)(8) (2) (2) Contract and San The second section of The company of the contract of The Market of the Commission of the second to the transfer of the contrast has been contracted to be THE RESERVE OF THE PROPERTY OF おおいていて なるなる The second of the contract of the second うり 大学 いっぱい er digital in halify year than r_{st} नड़ :

credible with respect to the repairs needed for the pool. He testified that the entire renovation needed to be redone, and that the proposal obtained by the Claimants was reasonable.

Accordingly, the following formula appropriately measures the Claimants' actual loss:

If the contractor did work according to the contract and the claimant has solicited or is soliciting another contractor to complete the contract, the claimant's actual loss shall be the amounts the claimant has paid to or on behalf of the contractor under the original contract, added to any reasonable amounts the claimant has paid or will be required to pay another contractor to repair poor work done by the original contractor under the original contract and complete the original contract, less the original contract price. If the Commission determines that the original contract price is too unrealistically low or high to provide a proper basis for measuring actual loss, the Commission may adjust its measurement accordingly.

COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c). The Claimants paid \$30,285.00 under the original contract, to which I must add \$23,500.00, the amount the Claimants must pay another contractor to repair the work. This equals \$53,785.00, from which I subtract \$30,285.00, the original contract price, for a total of \$23,500.00.

The Business Regulation Article caps a claimant's recovery at \$20,000.00 for acts or omissions of one contractor and provides that a claimant may not recover more than the amount paid to the contractor against whom the claim is filed. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(1), (5); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(4), D(2)(a). In this case, the Claimants' actual loss of \$23.500.00 exceeds \$20,000.00. Therefore, the Claimants' recovery is limited to \$20,000.00. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(1); COMAR 09.08.03.03D(2)(a).

aria was semente a religio de la contra de la contra la references the more coldinary lighterness tracegor the species of solar earns to a recommendation of the second o a respectively. The contemporary strains a material project of the contemporary of akitikali karihi katan eti kitalifiko kita permit kalipitali akitikin ang teksistan that in the other countries, as equal to be also be seen in the second of the t en film vir an antiron un gli et habitat dan en fil. Di sem in est de film film film legajasijekinintaga) 프로젝트 - 1800 1800 188일 글랜드 1800 1 en la coma de esta a la seguina de esta esta esta esta en la compansión de la compansión de la compansión de l and the contraction of the contr and makes the new colony for the transfer of a mention of some best of the first of the special property of the THE PROPERTY HELDER to discussion the company of the company of reputation of the contract of the emident, entre est comprese de desentant and d'activité du contrat. El constituir au pais de valides activité Real (O.) (C) Life (Street green) but have placed in the life in the life in the contract of the life in the life and the finite of the control of the strenger to be the control of the control of the control of the control of the first contribution of the first property of the first transfer and transfer

[14] (40) [[1] 在日本会社,中代本行为中国的社会

PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

I conclude that the Claimants have sustained an actual and compensable loss of \$23.500.00 as a result of the Respondent's acts or omissions. Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. §§ 8-401, 8-405 (2015); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c). I further conclude that the Claimants are entitled to recover \$20,000.00 from the Fund. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(1); COMAR 09.08.03.03D(2)(a).

RECOMMENDED ORDER

I RECOMMEND that the Maryland Home Improvement Commission:

ORDER that the Maryland Home Improvement Guaranty Fund award the Claimants \$20,000.00; and

ORDER that the Respondent is ineligible for a Maryland Home Improvement

Commission license until the Respondent reimburses the Guaranty Fund for all monies disbursed under this Order, plus annual interest of ten percent (10%) as set by the Maryland Home

Improvement Commission;³ and

ORDER that the records and publications of the Maryland Home Improvement Commission reflect this decision.

Deborah S. Richardson

June 9, 2021
Date Decision Issued

Deborah S. Richardson Administrative Law Judge

DSR/kdp #192441

³ See Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-410(a)(1)(iii) (2015); COMAR 09.08.01.20.

The Part of the Control of the Contr

in productionally resistantial or to sent in a retired continue in the sent of Survey as to continuous about 1884 long long to the contract of the contract of the contract of the contract of unitaria de la compansión de la compansión

Same in a commencial control of the control of the

Stranger of the control of the contr

Company of the compan

. Her with the state of the sta

The section of the complete of the second section of the section of the second section of the section of

South the first of the first specific and the south to be a metal by the state of the first and the so

o aperto miniscenti il privile di la calcinazione della di per con presenti di per

godine by the transfer

Tarlandadi. Historia. Alta construction of the GA

Part 34.000

Sun Spiritageprae Dala Service Projec

material de la Seconda de Company de la Comp

्रीचारको बर्लकोल्स्ट केन्द्र ह

4.00 10 00010

the transfer of a color of a color of the co

PROPOSED ORDER

WHEREFORE, this 30th day of August, 2021, Panel B of the Maryland Home Improvement Commission approves the Recommended Order of the Administrative Law Judge and unless any parties files with the Commission within twenty (20) days of this date written exceptions and/or a request to present arguments, then this Proposed Order will become final at the end of the twenty (20) day period. By law the parties then have an additional thirty (30) day period during which they may file an appeal to Circuit Court.

Joseph Tunney
Joseph Tunney

Chairman
Panel B
MARYLAND HOME IMPROVEMENT
COMMISSION

| | | • | | | | 1 |
|------|--|--|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------------|
| • | • | • | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | • | | | | • |
| | | | | | | |
| • | | V 1 | | | | |
| | • • | | •r | • | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| • | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | • | * : | | | | • |
| | | 1 1 | | | | |
| . ** | 4 | | | | | • |
| | | | * 1 5 | | | |
| | | • | | | | |
| | | | • | • | | |
| | | | 0.57 | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | • | 144. | | | | |
| | * 1.1 | | N 13 | ANTENNA PROPERTY | | |
| | | • | | | | |
| | | de grange in the light | are entre and a second | et begroup art | | Angline was the second |
| • | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | *4£ | 200 M Mg | - 13 km - 35 (2) (13 km) | eration and the | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | 388835536 | The Company of the Company | | na ang panggan | O Carteria (1985) | villag kårt i skiller i still |
| | | | | | | |
| | • | | , | | | |
| • | | | | | | 美国人民的国际公司 |
| | | | | • | | |
| | $\mathcal{F} = \mathcal{F} \cap \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{F}}$ | | | अंबद्धां । ५ । १ । १ । १ । १ । | · 有能的 · 数 。 | |
| | , . | | | | 7 | |
| • . | | | 3.38 G 3.38 | activities and the second | | |
| • | | | | | | |
| * | | 1 | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | D. Belskill | | |
| | | | , | artin de la company | | |
| | • | | • | | | |
| • | | 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1 | va njakareni. | ాతాంచి ఉన్నాయి. ఓక్షా తొయ్య కం | | |
| . • | • | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | • | | |
| • | | | | | | |
| • | | | | | | |
| • | | • | | | , . | |
| | - | | | • | | • |
| | | • | | | | |
| | | | | • | | |
| | • | | | | | |
| | | | 1 | | | |
| | | | | | | • |
| | • | | | | | |
| | | | ľ | | | |
| | | | . | | | |